

**To:** Wim Kimmerer [kimmerer@sfsu.edu]  
**Cc:** []  
**Bcc:** []  
**From:** CN=Tim Vendlinski/OU=R9/O=USEPA/C=US  
**Sent:** Wed 2/29/2012 11:33:13 PM  
**Subject:** Re: Last Call: RSVP requested for a technical workshop on estuarine habitat 27 March 2012 (Tuesday) 8:30-5:00 Sacramento  
[Estuarine Habitat Workshop draft bibliography 02.28.12.docx](#)  
[estuarine habitat bibliography Bruce 01.27.12 as amended.docx](#)  
[<kimmerer@sfsu.edu>](mailto:kimmerer@sfsu.edu)  
[<kimmerer@sfsu.edu>](mailto:kimmerer@sfsu.edu)  
<http://www.epa.gov/region9/water/watershed/sfbay-delta/index.html>  
[vendlinski.tim@epa.gov](mailto:vendlinski.tim@epa.gov)  
[kimmerer@sfsu.edu](mailto:kimmerer@sfsu.edu)  
[kimmerer@sfsu.edu](mailto:kimmerer@sfsu.edu)  
[kimmerer@sfsu.edu](mailto:kimmerer@sfsu.edu)  
(embedded image)  
(embedded image)

Here you go, Wim.

I'm attaching the "short list" (your list + Anke & Matt) and the "long list" (Bruce's list + Anke & Matt). ASC's analysis of key points, areas of agreement and disagreement (and sources thereof), and uncertainties will be confined to the short-list.

A few explanations:

In a note from you that Bruce shared with me you stated: "A few that were not in your list are (I think) justified by their demonstration of characteristics not previously understood, e.g.: loss of diatom production (Kimmerer 2005), loss of anchovies (Kimmerer 2006), and the importance of microzooplankton grazing (York et al.)."  
Based on this input, I retained those papers in the draft list I shared with Anke and Matt.

In my exchanges with Anke, she suggested adding Jassby (2008) "which contrasts "Suisun" (not the LSZ, but fairly close) with the Delta for a bunch of WQ variables" and Winder (2010) that "does the same for zooplankton." She stressed the need for "at least one 'real' phytoplankton paper – either Dugdale or Jassby," and she offered Lehman (2000) for inclusion on the "long list" as a phytoplankton paper specifically about the LSZ (I wasn't even going to produce a "long list" before she made the suggestion. I assume that she meant the same Jassby (2008) that she had suggested when she stressed the need for a "real" phytoplankton paper. We traded so many messages last Friday, I didn't nail-down that one point.

Cheers, Tim

**From:** Wim Kimmerer <kimmerer@sfsu.edu>  
**To:** Tim Vendlinski/R9/USEPA/US@EPA  
**Date:** 02/29/2012 02:34 PM  
**Subject:** Re: Last Call: RSVP requested for a technical workshop on estuarine habitat 27 March 2012 (Tuesday) 8:30-5:00 Sacramento

Tim, I would be interested in the final list if you would not mind sending it.

Thanks..Wim

On 02/29/2012 2:14 PM, Tim Vendlinski wrote:

Thanks, Wim.

Well, the train left the station and I had to make headway the best I could once Bruce left for Hawaii.

I managed to reach him there to ask about your list, and he endorsed your selections without reservation.

He did not say the list was preliminary, so I just ran with it (we're already way behind schedule on this task).

While Anke was a bit surprised by the selections on the list of 15, she observed that it was a difficult task and that there were many routes toward assembling a list.

Again, I'm grateful for the investment you made in the list you produced.

Best, Tim

From: Wim Kimmerer <kimmerer@sfsu.edu>

To: Tim Vendlinski/R9/USEPA/US@EPA

Date: 02/29/2012 01:56 PM

Subject: Re: Last Call: RSVP requested for a technical workshop on estuarine habitat 27 March 2012 (Tuesday) 8:30-5:00 Sacramento

Oops. That list was off-the-cuff, meant to stimulate discussions with Bruce. It is not meant to be the definitive list of relevant publications. I think if you really want the key papers on that or some other topic, it should involve more than one person and should have defined criteria for determining whether a paper should be included or not.

Bruce and I were talking about an annotated bibliography but it is taking too long and I don't know if we will be able to do it in time for your workshop.

Wim

On 02/29/2012 11:15 AM, Tim Vendlinski wrote:

I'm sorry to hear that, Wim, but I understand your need to focus on your lab and your students.

Nevertheless, you made a real contribution to the workshop by assisting Bruce with culling his list of 36 papers down to a more manageable list of 15 papers.

I took the initiative to circulate your list and Bruce's list to Anke and Matt Nobrina.

We all appreciated you taking the time to explain your criteria for making the cuts, and this put your decisions into perspective.

In the end, they suggested that I restore a few papers to the list that you had cut, and they proposed adding some papers that neither you or Bruce had noted.

Thanks to you four, we now have a strong list of 23 papers that should satisfy most workshop participants. Your work is well represented on the list, so you'll definitely have a presence at the workshop in absentia.

Best Always, Tim

From: Wim Kimmerer <kimmerer@sfsu.edu>  
To: Tim Vendlinski/R9/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 02/23/2012 12:50 PM  
Subject: Re: Last Call: RSVP requested for a technical workshop on estuarine habitat 27 March 2012 (Tuesday) 8:30-5:00 Sacramento

Hi Tim. I will not be able to make it, sorry.

Wim

On 02/23/2012 10:21 AM, Tim Vendlinski wrote:  
Dear Scientists:

In finalizing the list of participants for the upcoming technical workshop, I realized your status is still listed as likely, maybe, or unlikely.

In the coming days, I'll be broadcasting the final list of participants along with a draft workshop agenda, and the first of several papers being prepared specifically for the workshop.

If you will participate in the workshop, please let me know by tomorrow (FEB 24th), and I'll make the adjustment on the list of participants.

If you will not participate, please let me know that too so I can remove your name from the list.

We'll certainly miss your expertise and insights.

Best Regards, Tim

><(((q>.'-'.j..><(((q>.'-'.j..><(((q>

Tim Vendlinski  
Senior Policy Advisor  
Office of the Director (WTR-1)  
EPA Pacific Southwest Region  
75 Hawthorne Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105-3901  
<http://www.epa.gov/region9/water/watershed/sfbay-delta/index.html>  
>vendlinski.tim@epa.gov<  
phone: 415.972.3469  
fax: 415.947.3537

----- Forwarded by Tim Vendlinski/R9/USEPA/US on 01/18/2012 03:50 PM -----

Dear old friends and prospective colleagues:

You've been identified as an expert on matters surrounding estuarine habitat for the Bay Delta Estuary, and you're cordially invited to participate in an all-day technical workshop on 27 March 2012 (Tuesday) in downtown

Sacramento.

EPA is convening the workshop in partnership with the Aquatic Science Center (ASC), and the goal is to characterize how ecological processes and biological indicators change in response to different locations of the low salinity zone (LSZ) in the Estuary. At the workshop, a technical facilitator will engage ~20 scientists with expertise in estuarine ecology, fisheries, hydrodynamics, modeling, and water resource management.

Please respond to this invitation regarding your availability.

If you cannot participate, your seat will not be held for any substitute attendee. While space is at a premium, we will seek to accommodate non-participating observers.

We are sorry that due to severe budget constraints, EPA and ASC cannot compensate you for your time, travel, and lodging.

As you may know, the State Water Resources Control Board will soon initiate the update of Delta flow objectives in its Water Quality Control Plan for the San Francisco Bay/Sacramento-San Joaquin Delta Estuary. This presents the scientific community with an important opportunity to inform the Board's regulatory decisions about estuarine habitat standards. As a product of the workshop, the vast amount of scientific research done since 1995 that pertains to the LSZ and estuarine habitat will be reviewed, evaluated, and synthesized into a format that will be useful to the Board.

Feel free to contact me with any concerns or questions.

Thanks so much, Tim

--

Dr. Wim Kimmerer  
Romberg Tiburon Center  
San Francisco State University  
3152 Paradise Drive  
Tiburon CA 94920 USA  
415 338-3515  
kimmerer@sfsu.edu

--

Dr. Wim Kimmerer  
Romberg Tiburon Center  
San Francisco State University  
3152 Paradise Drive  
Tiburon CA 94920 USA  
415 338-3515  
kimmerer@sfsu.edu

--

Dr. Wim Kimmerer  
Romberg Tiburon Center  
San Francisco State University  
3152 Paradise Drive  
Tiburon CA 94920 USA  
415 338-3515  
kimmerer@sfsu.edu